

Journal of Latin American Studies

<http://journals.cambridge.org/LAS>

Additional services for *Journal of Latin American Studies*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



Dana Velasco Murillo, Mark Lentz and Margarita R. Ochoa (eds.), *City Indians in Spain's American Empire: Urban Indigenous Society in Colonial Mesoamerica and Andean South America, 1530–1810* (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2012), pp. xv+244, £55.00, hb.

LINDA A. NEWSON

Journal of Latin American Studies / Volume 45 / Issue 04 / November 2013, pp 821 - 822
DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X13001247, Published online: 13 November 2013

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0022216X13001247

How to cite this article:

LINDA A. NEWSON (2013). Journal of Latin American Studies, 45, pp 821-822
doi:10.1017/S0022216X13001247

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

the seventeenth century, but epidemic disease and migration might well have been the principal culprits, not the Toledan reducciones. In short, this is a useful book on an important topic, but the author seems to follow the lead of previous generations of scholars in accepting the propaganda of Toledo and his partisans, who may well have overemphasised the successes of the General Resettlement programme.

Southern Methodist University

KENNETH J. ANDRIEN

J. Lat. Amer. Stud. 45 (2013). doi:10.1017/S0022216X13001247

Dana Velasco Murillo, Mark Lentz and Margarita R. Ochoa (eds.), *City Indians in Spain's American Empire: Urban Indigenous Society in Colonial Mesoamerica and Andean South America, 1530–1810* (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2012), pp. xv + 244, £55.00, hb.

Spanish attempts to pursue a policy of residential segregation in the Americas, which involved the creation of an 'Indian republic' in the rural areas and a 'Spanish republic' in the urban centres, were doomed to failure given the dependence of cities on native labour. Thus, contrary to crown policy, Spanish urban centres became the residence of large numbers of Indians, who intermingled with Spaniards, often African slaves, and over time an increasing population of *castas*. Despite the large numbers of Indians that resided in urban areas, this segment of colonial society has not been the focus of scholarly attention, a state of affairs that David Cahill attributes to urban Indians being perceived as less 'authentically indigenous' than their rural counterparts.

This edited volume comprises ten detailed case studies based on archival sources that focus on Mexico, Guatemala and the Andean region. The majority are on Mexico City and Lima, though other essays consider second-order centres such as Mérida, Puebla, Zacatecas and Trujillo. Most cover limited time periods, mainly the seventeenth century, but two (Cahill and Lentz) cover the whole colonial period. Dominant themes in the essays are migration, identity, indigenous government, inter-ethnic relations and rural–urban interactions, and the emphasis is on the daily and lifetime experiences of urban Indians rather than their beliefs and cultural practices. In the introduction and conclusion John Chance and Kevin Terraciano respectively draw out some of the dominant themes and processes in play. The volume contains a welcome mix of studies by established and early-career scholars.

A number of essays consider the migration process, showing how it had a significant impact on the fabric of Indian urban society and the potential of its residents to create a separate identity. Three studies of Peru (by Charney, Ramos and O'Toole) reveal how Indians maintained links with their homelands, sometimes spending only part of the year in the city. They also show that labour, whether forced or free, was the prime mover for migration and inter-ethnic interaction, and that migrants were drawn from diverse social backgrounds and had equally diverse experiences within the city. These studies, together with those by Lentz for Mérida and Velasco Murillo and Sierra Silva for Puebla and Zacatecas, suggest that urban–rural relations and separate identities were more easily maintained where cities expanded on pre-existing urban settlements than where the cities were constructed largely from scratch and drew individuals from diverse communities. The study by Velasco Murillo and Sierra Silva, which compares the textile industry of Puebla with silver mining in Zacatecas, shows how different economies might generate different labour arrangements and workplace conditions and affect inter-ethnic interactions and marriage patterns.

Within the cities, Indians often attempted to maintain or forge an identity through involvement in urban government, though not always successfully. Connell shows that, through negotiation and alliances, native elites in Mexico City were able to retain an element of traditional native authority until 1565, when the last potential royal successor died. Similarly, Schroeder's study of the Nahua chronicler Chimalpahin reveals that in the early seventeenth century the ranking of different polities of Tenochtitlan was still recognised in official ceremonies. Engagement with colonial institutions was more successful in the cases of Cusco and Santiago de Guatemala. Cahill demonstrates how despite the 'deracination' of individuals before and after Spanish conquest and the resettlement of *ayllus* in Cusco, the Ayarmaca and Pumamarca were able to forge a distinct identity and social standing that was legally recognised by the crown. The role of political institutions in fostering identity is also examined by Herrera for Santiago de Guatemala, where the Spanish created eight indigenous wards with their own municipal councils and saints, while Lentz in his study of the indigenous *cabildos* of Mérida, Yucatán, shows how they succeeded in preserving a degree of cultural autonomy and in exercising some authority over land sales and petty crimes, which was facilitated by the use of the Yucatec Maya language. Land sales are also the focus of Ochoa's study of Mexico City, in which she shows how Nahua cultural values and concepts of landholding and land sales persisted into the eighteenth century.

The essays in the volume describe a diverse range of urban Indian experiences created by indigenous people as they forged their own livelihoods, political lives and identities, but within the constraints of a dominant political order. Only two studies (one by Ramos and the other by Velasco Murillo and Sierra Silva) adopt an explicitly comparative perspective, and it would be premature to generalise, given the limited research in the field. However, some factors emerge from the essays as being significant in influencing the urban Indian experience: the size of pre-Columbian populations and pre-existing social and political structures, the political and economic roles accorded to individual cities by the Spanish, specific labour and workplace arrangements associated with different types of economic activity, and the relative size of different ethnic groups, among others. Such perspectives would be worth further investigation.

It may be obvious, but it is worth noting that the essays here are dealing with those who defined themselves as Indians or were categorised as such by the secular or ecclesiastical authorities. However, some migrants sought to escape this categorisation by adopting Spanish ways and intermarrying with those from other ethnic groups. This raises the general question of what constitutes an 'Indian' and, following on from this, what constitutes an 'urban Indian', since as a number of essays in the volume indicate, Indians might circulate between urban and rural areas. The lack of precise definitions in this volume is not critical to the essays here, since most are case studies of particular times and places. However, as scholarship adopts a more comparative perspective, this issue will require fuller consideration.

This pioneering collection of scholarly essays represents a significant step forward in knowledge of a hitherto neglected segment of urban society and signposts many directions for future research. It is a welcome addition to the literature on the social history of colonial Spanish America.

*Institute of Latin American Studies and
King's College London*

LINDA A. NEWSON